20170045

State of North Bakota JOINT PROCEDURE COMMITTEE

CHAIR JUSTICE LISA FAIR McEVERS STAFF ATTORNEY MICHAEL J. HAGBURG

FIRST FLOOR JUDICIAL WING 600 E BOULEVARD AVE DEPT 180 BISMARCK, ND 58505-0530

February 6, 2017

FILED IN THE OFFICE OF THE CLERK OF SUPREME COURT

FEB - 6 2017 STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA

Honorable Gerald W. VandeWalle, Chief Justice North Dakota Supreme Court 600 East Boulevard Avenue Bismarck, ND 58505-0530

> Administrative Council Request for Amendments to North Dakota Court Rules Re:

Dear Chief Justice:

In a letter dated December 27, 2016, the Administrative Council requested that the Joint Procedure Committee consider whether amendments to the rules may be needed in response to the Marsy's Law constitutional amendment, N.D. Const. art. I, § 25. The committee discussed the council's request at its January 26-27 meeting and developed several proposed amendments to the rules, which are explained below. Copies of the proposed amended rules are attached.

N.D.R.Crim.P. 15, Depositions: A new paragraph (a)(5) is proposed to provide that a victim may refuse to participate in a deposition requested by the defendant or the defendant's attorney. The right to refuse a deposition is granted by N.D. Const. art. I, § 25(1)(f).

N.D.R.Crim.P. 16, Discovery and Inspection: An amendment to subdivision (f) is proposed to bar a prosecutor from disclosing contact information of a victim if the victim has requested nondisclosure of this information under N.D. Const. art. I, § 25(1)(e). It is also proposed that the explanatory note be reorganized and flawed internal references in the rule text be corrected.

N.D.R.Crim.P. 32, Sentencing and Judgment: An amendment to subparagraph

(c)(4)(B) is proposed to allow the prosecutor to disclose to the victim, on request, any material from the presentence report disclosed to the defendant and the defendant's counsel. The right to this material is granted by N.D. Const. art. I, $\S 25(1)(1)$.

N.D.R.Juv.P. 4, Interested Persons: A new paragraph (3) is proposed to allow a victim, on request, to take part in a delinquency case. The right to participate in a delinquency case is granted by N.D. Const. art. I, § 25(1)(g) among other provisions.

N.D.R.Juv.P. 12.1, Depositions: Amendments are proposed to paragraph (e)(1) to provide that a victim may refuse to participate in a deposition requested by a respondent or a respondent's attorney. The right to refuse a deposition is granted by N.D. Const. art. I, § 25(1)(f).

N.D.R.Ct. 3.4. Privacy Protection for Filings Made with the Court: Amendments are proposed to subdivision (a) to require, upon request of the victim, the redaction of all victim contact information from documents before they may be filed with the court in a criminal or delinquency case. This right is granted by N.D. Const. art. I, § 25(1)(e).

N.D. Sup. Ct. Admin. R. 41, Access to Court Records: A new paragraph 6(a)(6) is proposed to require, upon request of the victim, redaction of all victim contact information in a criminal court record. This right is granted by N.D. Const. art. I, § 25(1)(e). The Supreme Court's March 1, 2017, amendments are incorporated into the attached Rule 41 proposal.

The committee appreciates the Court's consideration of these proposals. Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely yours,

Lisa Fair McEvers

Chair, Joint Procedure Committee

RULE 15. DEPOSITIONS

1	(a) When Taken. At any time after the defendant has appeared, any party
2	may take testimony of any person by deposition including audio-visual depositions
3	taken as provided in N.D.R.Civ.P. 30.1, except:
4	(1) the defendant may not be deposed unless the defendant consents and the
5	defendant's lawyer, if the defendant has one, is present or the defendant waives the
6	lawyer's presence;
7	(2) a discovery deposition may be taken after the time set by the court only
8	with leave of court;
9	(3) a deposition to perpetuate testimony may be taken only with leave of
10	court, which must be granted upon motion of any party if it appears that the
11	deponent may be able to give material testimony but may be unable to attend a trial
12	or hearing; and
13	(4) upon motion of a party or of the deponent and upon a showing that the
14	taking of the deposition does or will unreasonably annoy, embarrass, or oppress, or
15	cause undue burden or expense to, the deponent or a party, the court in which the

prosecution is pending or a court of the jurisdiction where the deposition is being

scope and manner of its taking. Upon demand of the objecting party or deponent,

the taking of the deposition may be suspended for the time necessary to make the

taken may order that the deposition not be taken or continued or may limit the

16

17

18

motion:; and

(5) a victim may refuse to participate in a deposition requested by the defendant or the defendant's attorney.

Attendance of witnesses and production of documentary evidence and objects may be compelled by subpoena under Rule 17.

- (b) Witness Who Would Not Respond To Subpoena. If a party is granted leave to take a deposition to perpetuate testimony, the court, upon motion of the party and a showing of probable cause to believe that the deponent would not respond to a subpoena, by order must direct a law enforcement officer to take the deponent into custody and hold the deponent until the taking of the deposition commences but not to exceed six hours and to keep the deponent in custody during the taking of the deposition. If the motion is by the prosecuting attorney, the court, upon further motion by the prosecuting attorney and a showing of probable cause to believe the defendant would not otherwise attend the taking of the deposition, may make the same order for the defendant.
- (c) Notice Of Taking. The party at whose instance the deposition is to be taken shall give all parties reasonable written notice of the name and address of each person to be examined, the time and place for the deposition, and the manner of recording. Upon motion of a party or of the deponent, the court may change the time, place, or manner of record.
 - (d) How Taken. The deposition must be taken in the manner provided in

civil actions, except:

- (1) if the deposition is taken at a place over which this state lacks jurisdiction, it may be taken instead in the manner provided by the law of that place;
 - (2) it must be recorded by the means specified in the notice; and
- (3) upon motion of a party and a showing that a party or the deponent is engaging in serious misconduct at the taking of a deposition, the court by order may direct that the deposition's taking be continued in the presence of a designated officer, in which case the designated officer may preside over the remainder of the deposition's taking.
- (e) Place Of Taking. The deposition must be taken in a building where the trial may be held, at a place agreed upon by the parties, or at a place designated by special or general order of the court. If the defendant is in custody or subject to terms of release that prohibit leaving the state and does not appear before the court and understandingly and voluntarily waives the right to be present, a deposition to perpetuate testimony must not be taken at a place which requires transporting the defendant within a jurisdiction that does not confer upon law enforcement officers of this state the right to transport prisoners within it.
 - (f) Presence Of Defendant.
- (1) At Discovery Deposition. The defendant may be present at the taking of a discovery deposition, but if the defendant is in custody, the defendant may be

present only with leave of court.

- (2) At Deposition To Perpetuate Testimony. The defendant must be present at the taking of a deposition to perpetuate testimony, but if the defendant's counsel is present at the taking:
- (A) the court may excuse the defendant from being present if the defendant appears before the court and understandingly and voluntarily waives the right to be present;
- (B) the taking of the deposition may continue if the defendant, present when it commenced, leaves voluntarily; or
- (C) if the deposition's taking is presided over by a judicial officer, the judicial officer may direct that the deposition's taking or part of the deposition's taking be conducted in the defendant's absence if the judicial officer has justifiably excluded the defendant because of the defendant's disruptive conduct.
- (3) Unexcused Absence. If the defendant is not present at the commencement of the taking of a deposition to perpetuate testimony and the defendant's absence has not been excused:
- (A) its taking may proceed, in which case the deposition may be used only as a discovery deposition; or
- (B) if the deposition is taken at the instance of the prosecution, the prosecuting attorney may direct that the commencement of its taking be postponed until the defendant's attendance can be obtained, and the court, upon application of

83	the prosecuting attorney, by order may direct a law enforcement officer to take the
84	defendant into custody during the taking of the deposition.
85	(4) Taking Depositions Outside the United States Without the Defendant's
86	Presence. The deposition of a witness who is outside the United States may be
87	taken without the defendant's presence if the court makes case-specific findings of
88	all the following:
89	(A) the witness's testimony could provide substantial proof of a material
90	fact in a felony prosecution;
91	(B) there is a substantial likelihood that the witness's attendance at trial
92	cannot be obtained;
93	(C) the witness's presence for a deposition in the United States cannot be
94	obtained;
95	(D) the defendant cannot be present because:
96	(i) the country where the witness is located will not permit the defendant to
97	attend the deposition;
98	(ii) for an in-custody defendant, secure transportation and continuing
99	custody cannot be assured at the witness's location; or
100	(iii) for an out-of-custody defendant, no reasonable conditions will assure
101	an appearance at the deposition or at trial or sentencing; and
102	(E) the defendant can meaningfully participate in the deposition through
103	reasonable means.

(g) Payment Of Expenses. If the deposition is taken at the instance of the
prosecution, the court may, and in all cases where the defendant is unable to bear
the expense the court must, direct the state to pay the expense of taking the
deposition, including the reasonable expenses of travel and subsistence of defense
counsel and, if the deposition is to perpetuate testimony or if the court permits for
a discovery deposition, of the defendant in attending the deposition.

- (h) Substantive Use On Grounds Of Unavailability. So far as otherwise admissible under the rules of evidence, a deposition to perpetuate testimony may be used as substantive evidence at the trial or upon any hearing if the deponent is unavailable as defined in N.D.R.Ev. 804(a). A discovery deposition may then be so used if the court determines that the use is fair in light of the nature and extent of the total examination at the taking thereof, but it may be offered by the prosecution only if the defendant was present at its taking. If only a part of a deposition is offered in evidence by a party, an adverse party may require the offering of all of it that is relevant to the part offered.
- (i) Objections To Admissibility. Objections to receiving in evidence a deposition or part of a deposition may be made as provided in civil actions.
- (j) Deposition By Agreement Not Precluded. Nothing in this rule precludes the taking of a deposition, orally or upon written questions, or the use of a deposition, by agreement of the parties.

EXPLANATORY NOTE

Rule 15 was amended, effective January 1, 1980; March 1, 1990; March 1, 2016; . . .

Rule 15 is substantially the same as Rule 431, Uniform Rules of Criminal Procedure (1974). Former Rule 15, effective until January 1, 1980, was an adaptation of Fed.R.Crim.P. 15. The present rule provides for a greatly expanded use of depositions in criminal cases.

Subdivisions (a), (b), (f) and (h) were amended, effective March 1, 1990.

The amendments are technical in nature and no substantive change is intended.

Rule 15 was amended, effective March 1, 2006, in response to the December 1, 2002, revision of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure. The language and organization of the rule were changed to make the rule more easily understood and to make style and terminology consistent throughout the rules.

Subdivision (a) permits depositions to be taken to perpetuate testimony, as in the former rule, but also for discovery purposes, which was not previously provided for. Rather than requiring court approval of discovery depositions, this subdivision changes the emphasis by allowing them without court approval, subject to the right of a party or deponent to move under paragraph (4) to have a court order that the deposition be continued, not taken, or limited in scope or manner of taking. The court will set a time after which discovery depositions may not be taken without court permission. Leave of court is required for the taking of a deposition to perpetuate testimony.

Subdivision (a) was amended, effective March 1, 1990. The amendment was made to clarify the fact that audio-visual depositions may be taken under the rule. The amendment also provides that the method of taking audio-visual depositions is governed by N.D.R.Civ.P. 30.1.

Subdivision (a) was amended, effective ______, to add a new paragraph (a)(5) providing that a victim may refuse to participate in a deposition requested by the defendant or the defendant's attorney. This right is granted by N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(1)(f). "Victim" is defined in N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(4).

Subdivision (b) provides a method for securing the attendance of a depondent who would not respond to a subpoena. In addition, to ensure confrontation and the presence of the defendant required by subdivision (f)(2) to use the deposition at trial, the prosecuting attorney may move the court for an order to secure defendant's presence at the taking of a deposition.

Requirements for notice of the taking of a deposition are set forth in subdivision (c). The court may change the noticed time, place, or manner of recording upon motion of the deponent, as well as any party.

Subdivision (d) specifies that a deposition be taken in the same manner as in civil actions, with certain exceptions. Paragraph (1) covers depositions on enclaves over which the State of North Dakota lacks jurisdiction, such as Indian reservations, as well as depositions outside the physical boundaries of the state.

Paragraph (2) allows depositions to be recorded by other than stenographic means,

without a court order. Provision is made in paragraph (3) for a court to designate an official to preside over a deposition upon a showing of misconduct by a party or the deponent.

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

The place of taking a deposition is governed by subdivision (e). Restriction is placed on taking depositions outside of this state in situations where the defendant may not travel or be transported to the proposed location, unless the defendant waives the right to be present.

Subdivision (f) concerns the presence of the defendant at a deposition. Distinction is made between a discovery deposition and one to perpetuate testimony. The defendant is not required to be present at a discovery deposition, but the defendant's presence may enable the prosecution to use the deposition as substantive evidence at trial, as provided in subdivision (h). The taking of a deposition to perpetuate testimony necessitates the defendant's presence, with four exceptions: defendant is excused by the court upon an appearance and voluntary waiver of the right to be present; defendant is voluntarily absent after start of deposition; a judicial officer presiding over the deposition justifiably excludes the defendant because of the defendant's disruptive conduct; or the court allows a deposition to be taken outside the United States without the defendant's presence after making case-specific findings. No warning is expressly required before exclusion, as in Rule 43(b)(2). If the defendant is not present at a deposition to perpetuate testimony under one of the above exceptions, the defendant's counsel

must be.

Paragraph (3) of subdivision (f) covers the situation when the defendant is not present at the start of a deposition to perpetuate testimony and has not been excused under paragraph (2). The taking may proceed as a discovery deposition or the prosecuting attorney, if the prosecuting attorney is taking the deposition, may postpone the taking and secure a court order to take the defendant into custody to assure the defendant's presence, so that the deposition will have the greater admissibility of a perpetuation deposition.

Paragraph (f)(4) was adopted, effective March 1, 2016, to allow a deposition to be taken outside the United States without the defendant's presence in certain specified circumstances. The provision was based on Fed.R.Crim.P. 15(c)(3).

SOURCES: Joint Procedure Committee Minutes of <u>January 26-27, 2017</u>,

pages _____; April 23-24, 2015, pages 26-27; January 27-28, 2005, page 12; April 20, 1989, pages 4-5; March 24-25, 1988, pages 6-7; December 3, 1987, pages 9-10 and 15; January 25-26, 1979, pages 5-7; December 7-8, 1978, pages 33-37;

October 12-13, 1978, page 3; April 2- 26, 1973, pages 9-10; June 26-27, 1972, page 3; December 11-12, 1968, pages 2-24; September 26-27, 1968, pages 2-6;

Rule 431, Uniform Rules of Criminal Procedure (1974).

STATUTES AFFECTED:

SUPERSEDED: N.D.C.C. ch. 31-06.

209	CONSIDERED: N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25; N.D.C.C. ch. 31-04.
210	CROSS REFERENCE: N.D.R.Crim.P. 17 (Subpoena); N.D.R.Crim.P. 43
211	(Defendant's Presence); N.D.R.Civ.P. 30.1 (Uniform Audio-Visual Deposition
212	Rule); N.D.R.Ev. 804 (Hearsay Exceptions; Declarant Unavailable).

RULE 16. DISCOVERY AND INSPECTION

1	(a) Disclosure of Evidence by Prosecuting Attorney.
2	(1) Information Subject to Disclosure.
3	(A) Statement of Defendant. Upon a defendant's written request, the
4	prosecuting attorney must disclose to the defendant and make available for
5	inspection, copying, or photographing all of the following:
6	(i) any relevant written or recorded statement by the defendant, if:
7	—the statement is within the prosecution's possession, custody, or control;
8	and
9	—the prosecuting attorney knows—or through due diligence could
10	know—that the statement exists;
11	(ii) the portion of any written record containing the substance of any
12	relevant oral statement made before or after arrest if the defendant made the
13	statement in response to interrogation by a person the defendant knew was a
14	government agent;
15	(iii) the defendant's recorded testimony before a grand jury relating to the
16	charged offense; and
17	(iv) the substance of any other oral statement made by the defendant, before
18	or after arrest, in response to interrogation by a person the defendant knew was a
19	government agent.

(B) Organizational Defendant. Upon a defendant's request, if the defendant is an organization such as a corporation, partnership, association, or labor union, the prosecution must disclose to the defendant any statements described in Rule 16(a)(1)(A) if the prosecution contends that the person making the statement:

- (i) was legally able to bind the defendant regarding the subject of the statement because of that person's position as the defendant's director, officer, employee, or agent; or
- (ii) was personally involved in the alleged conduct constituting the offense and was legally able to bind the defendant regarding that conduct because of that person's position as the defendant's director, officer, employee, or agent.
- (C) Defendant's Previous Record. Upon a defendant's written request, the prosecution must furnish the defendant with a copy of the defendant's prior criminal record, if any, that is within the prosecution's possession, custody, or control if the prosecuting attorney knows—or through due diligence could know—that the record exists.
- (D) Documents and Objects. Upon a defendant's written request, the prosecuting attorney must permit the defendant to inspect and to copy or photograph books, papers, documents, data, photographs, tangible objects, buildings, or places, or copies or portions of any of these items, if the item is within the prosecution's possession, custody, or control, and:
 - (i) the item is material to preparing the defense;

(ii) the prosecution i	intends to use the	e item in its ca	se-in-chief at	trial; or
(iii) the item was ob	tained from or b	elongs to the d	lefendant.	

- (E) Reports of Examinations and Tests. Upon a defendant's written request, the prosecuting attorney must permit a defendant to inspect and to copy or photograph the results or reports of any physical or mental examinations, and of any scientific tests or experiments if:
 - (i) the item is within the prosecution's possession, custody, or control;
- (ii) the prosecuting attorney knows—or through due diligence could know—that the item exists; and
- (iii) the item is material to preparing the defense or the prosecution intends to use the item in its case-in-chief at the trial.
- (F) Expert Witnesses. Upon a defendant's written request, the prosecution must give to the defendant a written summary of any testimony that the prosecution intends to use under N.D.R.Ev. 702, 703, or 705 during its case-in-chief at trial. If the prosecution requests discovery under Rule 16(b)(1)(C)(ii) and the defendant complies, the prosecution must, upon the defendant's written request, give to the defendant a written summary of testimony that the government intends to use under N.D.R.Ev. 702, 703, or 705 as evidence at trial on the issue of the defendant's mental condition. Expert witness summaries must describe the witness's opinions, the bases and reasons for those opinions, and the witness's qualifications.

(2) Information Not Subject to Disclosure. Except as Rule 16(a)(1) provides otherwise, this rule does not authorize the discovery or inspection of reports, memoranda, or other internal prosecution documents made by an attorney for the prosecution or other prosecution agent in connection with investigating or prosecuting the case. Nor does this rule authorize the discovery or inspection of statements made by prosecution witnesses or prospective prosecution witnesses (other than the defendant) to agents of the prosecution except as provided in Rule 16 (f).

(b) Defendant's Disclosure.

- (1) Information Subject to Disclosure.
- (A) Documents and Objects. If a defendant, in writing, requests disclosure under Rule 16 (a)(1)(C) or (D), and the prosecution complies, then the defendant, upon written request of the prosecution, must permit the prosecution to inspect and to copy or photograph books, papers, documents, data, photographs, tangible objects, buildings or places, or copies or portions of any of these items if:
 - (i) the item is within the defendant's possession, custody, or control: and
- (ii) the defendant intends to use the item in the defendant's case-in-chief at trial.
- (B) Reports of Examinations and Tests. If a defendant, in writing, requests disclosure under Rule 16(a)(1)(C) or (D) (E) and the prosecution complies, the defendant, upon written request of the prosecution, must permit the prosecution to

83 inspect and to copy or photograph the results or reports of any physical or mental 84 examination and of any scientific test or experiment if: (i) the item is within the defendant's possession, custody, or control; and 85 86 (ii) the defendant intends to use the item in the defendant's case-in-chief at 87 trial or intends to call the witness who prepared the report and the report relates to 88 the witness's testimony. 89 (C) Expert Witnesses. The defendant must, upon written request of the 90 prosecution, give to the prosecution a written statement of any testimony that the 91 defendant intends to use under N.D.R.Ev. 702, 703, or 705 as evidence at trial, if: 92 (i) the defendant requests disclosure under Rule 16(a)(1)(E) and the 93 prosecution complies; or 94 (ii) the defendant has given notice under Rule 12.2(b) of an intent to present 95 expert testimony on the defendant's mental condition. 96 This summary must describe the witness's opinions, the bases and reasons 97 for these opinions, and the witness's qualifications. 98 (2) Information not Subject to Disclosure. Except for scientific or medical 99 reports, Rule 16(b) does not authorize the discovery or inspection of reports. 100 memoranda, or other documents made by the defendant or the defendant's attorney 101 or agent during the case's investigation or defense or of statements made to the 102 defendant, or the defendant's attorney or agent, by the defendant, a prosecution or

defense witness, or a prospective prosecution or defense witness.

104	(c) Continuing Duty to Disclose. A party who discovers additional evidence
105	or material before or during trial must promptly disclose its existence to the other
106	party or the court if:
107	(1) the evidence or material is subject to discovery or inspection under this
108	rule; and
109	(2) the other party previously requested, or the court ordered, its production.
110	(d) Regulating Discovery.
111	(1) Protective and Modifying Orders. At any time the court may, for good
112	cause, deny, restrict, or defer discovery or inspection, or grant other appropriate
113	relief. Upon motion, the court may permit a party to show good cause by a written
114	statement that the court will inspect in camera. If relief is granted following a
115	showing in camera, the court must preserve the entire text of the party's statement
116	under seal.
117	(2) Failure to Comply. If a party fails to comply with this rule or with an
118	order issued under this rule, the court may:
119	(i) order that party to permit the discovery or inspection: specify its time,
120	place and manner; and prescribe other just terms and conditions;
121	(ii) grant a continuance;
122	(iii) prohibit that party from introducing the undisclosed evidence;
123	(iv) relieve the requesting party from making a disclosure required by this
124	rule; or

125	(v) enter any other order that is just under the circumstances.
126	(e) Alibi Witnesses. Discovery of alibi witnesses is governed by Rule 12.1.
127	(f) Demands for Production of Names, Addresses, and Statements of
128	Witnesses; Statements of Codefendants; Statements of Other Persons.
129	(1) Names, Addresses, and Statements of Prosecution Witnesses. Upon a
130	defendant's written request, the prosecution must furnish the defendant:
131	(A) a written list of the names and addresses of all prosecution witnesses
132	whom the prosecution intends to call during its case-in-chief;
133	(B) any statements made by the listed prosecution witnesses; and
134	(C) any records of prior criminal convictions of the listed prosecution
135	witnesses that the prosecuting attorney knows—or by the exercise of due diligence
136	could know—to exist.
137	A prosecutor may not disclose victim contact information, including the
138	address of a victim, if the victim has requested nondisclosure. If a defendant makes
139	a written request for discovery of the names, addresses, and statements of
140	witnesses, the prosecuting attorney must be allowed to perpetuate the testimony of
141	those witnesses under Rule 15.
142	(2) Statements of Codefendants. Upon a defendant's written request the
143	prosecution must permit the defendant to inspect and to copy or photograph any
144	relevant written or recorded confession, admission, or statement of a codefendant,
145	or copies of any of these items if:

146	(A) the item is within the prosecution's possession, custody, or control; and
147	(B) the prosecuting attorney knows—or through due diligence could
148	know—that the item exists.(3) Statements of Other Persons. Upon a defendant's
149	written request, the prosecution must permit the defendant to inspect and to copy
150	or photograph any relevant written or recorded statement of any person if:
151	(A) the statement is within the prosecution's possession, custody, or control;
152	(B) the prosecuting attorney knows—or through the exercise of due
153	diligence could know—that the statement exists; and
154	(C) the statement is not available to the defendant under Rule 16(a) or
155	16(f)(1) and (2).
156	(4) The term "statement," as used in Rule 16(f) means:
157	(A) a written statement made by the witness, codefendant, or other person
158	and signed or otherwise adopted by the declarant; or
159	(B) a stenographic, mechanical, electronic, or other record, or a
160	transcription of a record, which is a substantially verbatim recital of an oral
161	statement made by the witness, codefendant, or other person to an agent of the
162	prosecution and recorded contemporaneously with the making of the oral
163	statement.
164	EXPLANATORY NOTE
165	Rule 16 was amended, effective September 1, 1983; March 1, 1990; March
166	1, 1994; March 1, 1997; March 1, 2006;

Prior to the adoption of this rule, discovery proceeded on an informal basis.

The only requirement placed upon the prosecutor was the constitutional imperative that the suppression by the prosecution of evidence favorable to an accused upon request violates due process where the evidence is material either to the guilt or punishment, irrespective of the good faith or bad faith of the prosecution.

While the rule, as amended, provides greater discovery, it is intended to prescribe only the minimum amount of discovery to which the parties are entitled. It is not intended to limit the judge's discretion to order broader discovery in appropriate cases. Nor is it intended to prevent the voluntary disclosure of other evidence or material by the parties at any time.

Rule 16 was amended, effective March 1, 2006, in response to the December 1, 2002, revision of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure. The language and organization of the rule were changed to make the rule more easily understood and to make style and terminology consistent throughout the rules.

Subdivision (a)(1)(A) was amended, effective March 1, 1994, in response to the 1991 federal amendment. The amendment to North Dakota's rule requires the prosecution, upon written request, to disclose that portion of any written record containing the substance of any oral statement made by the defendant in response to interrogation by any person then known to the defendant to be an agent of the government. The amendment also requires the prosecution, upon written request, to disclose the substance of any oral statement made by the defendant in response

to interrogation by any person then known by the defendant to be an agent of the government.

Unlike the federal rule, North Dakota's rule does not allow the government to assess whether a written record containing the substance of an oral statement, or the substance of an oral statement, is relevant. The written record containing the substance of any oral statement, or the substance of any oral statement, must be disclosed regardless of whether the prosecution considers the oral statement relevant, and regardless of whether the prosecution intends to use the oral statement.

Subparagraphs (a)(1)(E) and (b)(1)(C) were adopted, effective March 1,

2006. These provisions set conditions for reciprocal disclosure by the prosecution
and defendant of proposed expert witness testimony.

Subdivision (f) was adopted, effective September 1, 1983. The provisions were drawn from Rules 421 and 422, Uniform Rules of Criminal Procedure (1974); Standard 11-2.1, American Bar Association Standards for Criminal Justice (2d ed. 1980); and Fed.R.Crim.P. 16's provision requiring disclosure of expert witness information.

Subdivision (f) does not require, as did former subdivision (i), that the person whose statement is produced must first have testified on direct examination. It is intended that the listed statements be discoverable at any point in the proceedings.

Subdivision (f) was amended, effective	<u>to bar a</u>
prosecutor from disclosing contact information of a victim is	f the victim has
requested nondisclosure under N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(1)(e)	. "Victim" is defined
in N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(4).	

Subdivision (a)(1)(A) was amended, effective March 1, 1994, in response to the 1991 federal amendment. The amendment to North Dakota's rule requires the prosecution, upon written request, to disclose that portion of any written record containing the substance of any oral statement made by the defendant in response to interrogation by any person then known to the defendant to be an agent of the government. The amendment also requires the prosecution, upon written request, to disclose the substance of any oral statement made by the defendant in response to interrogation by any person then known by the defendant to be an agent of the government.

Unlike the federal rule, North Dakota's rule does not allow the government to assess whether a written record containing the substance of an oral statement, or the substance of an oral statement, is relevant. The written record containing the substance of any oral statement, or the substance of any oral statement, must be disclosed regardless of whether the prosecution considers the oral statement relevant, and regardless of whether the prosecution intends to use the oral statement.

Subparagraphs (a)(1)(E) and (b)(1)(C) were adopted, effective March 1,

230	2006. These provisions set conditions for reciprocal disclosure by the prosecution
231	and defendant of proposed expert witness testimony.
232	SOURCES: Joint Procedure Committee Minutes of January 26-27, 2017,
233	pages : January 27-28, 2005, pages 12-13; April 25, 1996, page 15; January
234	25-26, 1996, pages 22-23; April 27-28, 1995, pages 2-3; September 29-30, 1994,
235	pages 7-9; April 28-29, 1994, pages 12-14; April 29-30, 1993, pages 10-11;
236	January 28-29, 1993, pages 12-13; April 20, 1989, page 4; December 3, 1987, page
237	15; February 17-18, 1983, pages 5-11; November 18-19, 1982, pages 5-10;
238	September 30-October 1, 1982, pages 3-6; April 15-16, 1982, page 1; December
239	7-8, 1978, pages 9-13; October 12-13, 1978, pages 3-8; September 27, 1974, page
240	4; October 17-20, 1972, pages 1-2; June 26-27, 1972, pages 9-14; December
241	11-12, 1968, pages 4-13; Fed.R.Crim.P. 16.
242	STATUTES AFFECTED: None.
243	CONSIDERED: N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25.
244	CROSS REFERENCE: N.D.R.Crim.P. 12.1 (Notice of Alibi Defense);
245	N.D.R.Crim.P. 17.1 (Omnibus Hearing and Pretrial Conference); N.D.R.Ev. 612
246	(Writing or Object Used to Refresh Memory); N.D.R.Ev. 702 (Testimony by
247	Experts); N.D.R.Ev. 703 (Bases of Opinion Testimony by Experts); N.D.R.Ev. 705
248	(Disclosure of Facts or Data Underlying Expert Opinion). See also: N.D.C.C. ch.
249	29-10.1 (Grand Jury); N.D.C.C. ch.29-10.2 (State Grand Jury).

RULE 32. SENTENCING AND JUDGMENT

1	(a) Sentence.
2	(1) Time of Sentencing. The court must impose sentence or other authorized
3	disposition without unnecessary delay. Until disposition, the court may continue or
4	alter bail or require the defendant to be held without bail.
5	(2) Presentence Requirements. Before imposing sentence, the court must:
6	(A) determine whether the defendant and the defendant's counsel had an
7	opportunity to read and discuss the presentence investigation report, if made
8	available under Rule 32(c)(4)(B), or a summary made available under Rule
9	32(c)(4)(D);
10	(B) give counsel an opportunity to speak on behalf of the defendant; and
11	(C) determine whether the defendant wishes to make a statement on the
12	defendant's own behalf or wishes to present information in mitigation of
13	punishment or information that would require the court to withhold judgment and
14	sentence.
15	The court must give the prosecution an opportunity to be heard on any
16	matter material to the imposition of sentence.
17	(3) Notification of Right to Appeal. After imposing sentence in a case that
18	has gone to trial, the court must advise the defendant of the defendant's right to
19	appeal and of the right of a person who is unable to pay the costs of an appeal to

20	apply for appointment of counsel for purposes of appeal. The court is under no
21	duty to advise the defendant of any right of appeal when sentence is imposed
22	following a plea of guilty.
23	(b) Judgment. A judgment of conviction must include the plea, the verdict,
24	and the sentence imposed. If the defendant is found not guilty or for any reason is
25	entitled to be discharged, the court must enter judgment accordingly. The judge
26	must sign and the clerk must enter the judgment.
27	(c) Presentence Investigation.
28	(1) When Made. The court may order a presentence investigation and report
29	at any time. Except when the defendant consents in writing, the report may not be
30	submitted to the court or its contents disclosed unless the defendant has pleaded
31	guilty or has been found guilty.
32	(2) Presence of Counsel. The defendant's counsel is entitled to notice and a
33	reasonable opportunity to attend any interview of the defendant conducted by
34	parole and probation staff in the course of a presentence investigation.
35	(3) Report.
36	(A) Contents of Report. The presentence report may contain the defendant's
37	previous criminal record and information about the defendant's characteristics,
38	including:
39	(i) family, educational, and social history;
40	(ii) employment history and financial condition;

41	(iii) circumstances affecting the defendant's behavior that may be helpful in
42	imposing sentence or in the correctional treatment of the defendant; and
43	(iv) any information required by the court.
44	(B) Information Excluded from Report. The following types of information
45	may not be included in a presentence report, but may be submitted to the court as
46	an addendum to the report:
47	(i) any diagnostic or prognostic opinion that, if disclosed, might seriously
48	disrupt a program of rehabilitation;
49	(ii) information or sources of information obtained confidentially, but
50	subject to disclosure by the court as provided in Rule 32(c)(4)(A);
51	(iii) any sentence recommendation by parole and probation staff or the
52	victim;
53	(iv) any victim impact statement; or
54	(v) any other information, including medical, psychiatric, or psychological
55	information, information relating to the victim or victims, and other matters the
56	court may consider confidential, that if disclosed, might result in harm, physical or
57	otherwise, to the defendant, to a victim, or to other persons.
58	(4) Disclosure of Presentence Report.
59	(A) Confidentiality. The presentence report and any addendum are
60	confidential. Neither the public nor the parties may read or copy the presentence
61	report or any addendum, unless the court, in its discretion, gives permission.

(B) Disclosure to Defendant. If the court allows the defendant to examine any part of the presentence report or any addendum, this disclosure must be made at least 14 days before sentence is imposed, unless the defendant waives the 14-day requirement. The court must provide the defendant and the defendant's counsel a copy of the disclosed material and give them an opportunity to comment. The court may allow the defendant and the defendant's counsel to introduce testimony or other information relating to any alleged factual inaccuracy in the disclosed material. Any material disclosed to the defendant and the defendant's counsel must also be disclosed to the prosecuting attorney who must disclose it to the victim if requested to do so. Material from a presentence report and any addendum disclosed under this provision must remain confidential and may not be read or copied by anyone else except as allowed by Rule 32(c) or federal law.

- (C) Disclosure to Attorney General. The court may disclose the presentence report and any addendum to the Attorney General or the Attorney General's designee only for purposes of the individual risk assessment required by N.D.C.C. § 12.1-32-15 (12) and (13). A presentence report and addendum disclosed to the Attorney General or the Attorney General's designee must remain confidential and may not be read or copied by anyone else except as allowed by Rule 32(c) or federal law.
- (D) Disclosure to Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation. The presentence report and any addendum is available to the Department of

Corrections and Rehabilitation for use in providing assessment and treatment services to the person when in the Department's custody, on parole from the Department, or under the supervision and management of the Department. The Department may share the presentence report and any addendum with a public treatment or transition facility or licensed private treatment or transition facility providing assessment and treatment services to the person when in the Department's custody, on parole from the Department, or under the supervision and management of the Department. The Department may share the presentence report and any addendum with the compact administrator of a supervising state in accordance with the Interstate Compact for Adult Offender Supervision, N.D.C.C. ch. 12-65. A presentence report and any addendum disclosed under this provision must remain confidential and may not be read or copied by anyone else except as allowed by Rule 32(c) or federal law.

- (E) Harmful Information. If the court finds there is information in the presentence report or any addendum that would be harmful to the defendant or to other persons if disclosed, the court must not permit the public or the parties to read or copy that portion of the report or the addendum. The court must give an oral or written summary of any non-disclosed information it will rely on in determining sentence and must give the defendant or the defendant's counsel an opportunity to comment. The court may give its summary to the parties in camera.
 - (F) Defendant's Comments. If the comments of the defendant and the

defendant's counsel, or testimony or other information introduced by them, allege any factual inaccuracy in the presentence report or any addendum, or in any of the information summarized, the court, for each matter controverted, must:

- (i) make a finding on the allegation, or
- (ii) make a determination that no finding is necessary because the matter controverted will not be taken into account in sentencing.

A written record of the court's findings and determinations must be appended to and accompany any copy of the presentence report later made available to the parole board or the pardon clerk.

(d) [Transferred]

- (e) Probation. After conviction of an offense, the defendant may be placed on probation as provided by law.
 - (f) Revocation of Probation When Court Retains Jurisdiction Under Law.
- (1) Taking into Custody. If there is probable cause to believe a probationer has violated a condition of probation, the court that originally placed the probationer on probation may conduct a hearing on the alleged violation. Any state parole and probation officer or any peace officer directed by a state parole and probation officer or directed by an order of the court having jurisdiction may take the probationer into custody and bring the probationer before the court. Costs incurred in bringing the probationer before the court must be borne by the county in which the probation was granted. The probationer may be admitted to bail

125	pending the hearing.
126	(2) Transfer. If the probationer does not contest the violation, the hearing
127	may be transferred, under the procedure set out in Rule 20, to the county where the
128	probationer is arrested, held or present. This procedure is available only upon the
129	consent of the court that placed the probationer on probation.
130	(3) Hearing.
131	(A) In General. The hearing must be in open court with:
132	(i) the probationer present;
133	(ii) a prior written notice of the alleged violation given to the probationer;
134	and
135	(iii) representation by retained or appointed counsel unless waived.
136	The probationer must be given an opportunity to make a statement and
137	present evidence in mitigation.
138	(B) Resolution. If the probationer contests the violation, the prosecution
139	must establish the violation by a preponderance of the evidence. After the hearing
140	and subject to limitations imposed by law, the court may:
141	(i) revoke an order suspending a sentence or an order suspending the
142	imposition of sentence; or
143	(ii) continue probation on the same or different conditions.
144	A record of the proceedings must be made.
145	EXPLANATORY NOTE

Rule 32 was amended, effective January 1, 1980; March 1, 1986; March 1, 1990; March 1, 1992, on an emergency basis; July 14, 1993; March 1, 1999;

October 31, 2001, on an emergency basis; April 1, 2002; March 1, 2006; March 1, 2007; March 1, 2008; March 1, 2010; March 1, 2011;

________.

Rule 32 was amended, effective March 1, 2006, in response to the December 1, 2002, revision of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure. The language and organization of the rule were changed to make the rule more easily understood and to make style and terminology consistent throughout the rules.

Paragraph (c)(4) was amended, effective March 1, 1999, to allow the court to decide, in its discretion, whether a presentence investigation report and any addendum may be inspected by the public or the parties.

Parole and probation staff conducting a presentence investigation must be mindful that they cannot make a binding promise of complete confidentiality regarding information included in the addendum to a presentence report. Under paragraph (c)(4), the promise of confidentiality is subject to the court's discretion to allow the parties to inspect the addendum.

Paragraph (c)(4) was amended, effective October 31, 2001, to allow disclosure of the presentence report and any addendum to the Attorney General or the Attorney General's designee to enable the Attorney General to comply with subsections 12 and 13 of N.D.C.C. § 12.1-32-15. Disclosure to the Attorney General or the Attorney General's designee must comply with all applicable state

and federal statutes, rules and regulations governing drug and alcohol records, and private medical information.

Paragraph (c)(4) was amended, effective March 1, 2008, to allow disclosure of the presentence report and any addendum to the Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation or its designees so that the Department can obtain assessment and treatment services. Disclosure to the Department or its designees must comply with all applicable state and federal statutes, rules and regulations governing drug and alcohol records, and private medical information.

Subparagraph (c)(4)(B) was amended, effective March 1, 2011, to change the time to disclose a presentence report from 10 to 14 days before sentence is imposed.

Subparagraph (c)(4)(B) was amended, effective , to allow the prosecutor to disclose to the victim, on request, any material from the presentence report disclosed to the defendant and the defendant's counsel. "Victim" is defined in N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(4).

Subdivision (d) on withdrawal of guilty pleas was transferred to Rule 11 effective March 1, 2010.

Paragraph (f)(2) was added, effective March 1, 2006, to allow transfer of a revocation hearing to the county where the probationer is present. Rule 20 (Transfer from the County for Plea and Sentence) sets out the procedure for obtaining a transfer.

188	Paragraph (f)(3) is adapted in part from the A.B.A. Standards for Criminal
189	Justice, Standards Relating to Probation, § 5.4 at 65 (Approved Draft, 1970).
190	Paragraph (f)(3) was amended, effective, March 1, 2007, to clarify that a
191	probationer must be given the opportunity to make a statement and present
192	mitigating information at a revocation hearing.
193	SOURCES: Joint Procedure Committee Minutes of <u>January 26-27, 2017</u> ,
194	pages : April 29-30, 2010, page 20; January 29-30, 2009, pages 11-13, 19-20;
195	January 24, 2008; January 26, 2006, page 9; April 28-29, 2005, pages 3-5; January
196	27-28, 2005, pages 28-29; January 24-25, 2002, pages 9-14; January 29-30, 1998,
197	pages 10-11; September 25-26, 1997, pages 3-6; January 30, 1997, pages 2-6;
198	September 26-27, 1996, pages 6-8; April 25, 1996, pages 16-18; November 7-8,
199	1991, page 4; October 25-26, 1990, pages 15-16; April 20, 1989, page 4;
200	December 3, 1987, page 15; November 29, 1984, pages 15-18; April 26, 1984,
201	page 6; December 7-8, 1978, pages 15-23; October 12-13, 1978, pages 10-14;
202	December 11-15, 1972, pages 5-16; November 20-21, 1969, pages 5-6; May
203	15-16, 1969, pages 1-2; February 20-21, 1969, pages 5-14; Fed.R.Crim.P. 32.
204	STATUTES AFFECTED:
205	SUPERSEDED: N.D.C.C. §§ 12-53-15, 29-14-22, 29-26-01, 29-26-02,
206	29-26-15, 29-26-19, 33-12-26, 33-12-27, 33-12-29.
207	CONSIDERED: N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25; N.D.C.C. §§ 1-01-41, 12-53-03,
208	12-53-04, 12-53-05, 12-53-06, 12-53-10, 12-53-11, 12-53-12, 12-53-13, 12-53-14,

209	12-53-17, 12-53-20, 12-55-30, 29-26-03, 29-26-11, 29-26-12, 29-26-13, 29-26-14
210	29-26-16, 29-26-17, 29-26-18, 29-26-20, 29-26-23, 33-12-28.
211	CROSS REFERENCE: N.D.R.Crim.P. 20 (Transfer from the County for
212	Plea and Sentence); N.D.C.C. § 12.1-32-15.

RULE 4. INTERESTED PERSONS

1	Persons who may participate in a juvenile matter include:
2	(1) the parties as defined in Rule 3(b);
3	(2) the child's guardian ad litem;
4	(3) the victim in a delinquency case, if requested by the victim;
5	(3) (4) in the case of an Indian child, the child's Indian custodian and Indian
6	tribe through the tribal representative;
7	(4) (5) in the case of a foster child, the child's foster parents, pre-adoptive
8	parents and relatives providing care for the child;
9	(5) (6) any other person who is named by the court to be important to a
10	resolution that is in the best interests of the child.
11	EXPLANATORY NOTE
12	Rule 4 was adopted effective March 1, 2010. In these rules, the term
13	"guardian ad litem" includes lay and attorney guardians ad litem. Amended
14	effective .
15	Paragraph (3) was added, effective, to allow a victim,
16	on request, to take part in a delinquency case. "Victim" is defined in N.D. Const.
17	Art. I, § 25(4).
18	SOURCES: Juvenile Policy Board Minutes of February 20, 2009;
19	December 5, 2008; August 8, 2008; May 9, 2008; February 29, 2008; September

20	21, 2007; April 20, 2007. Joint Procedure Committee Minutes of
21	January 26-27, 2017, pages ; May 21-22, 2009.
22	STATUTES AFFECTED:
23	CONSIDERED: N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25; N.D.C.C. ch. 12.1-35.
24	CROSS REFERENCE: N.D.R.Juv.P. 3 (Contents of Petition); N.D.C.C. ch
25	12.1-35 (Child Victim and Witness Fair Treatment Standards).

RULE 12.1 DEPOSITIONS

1	(a) Agreement of Parties. Upon agreement of the parties, a deposition may
2	be taken on oral examination.
3	(b) Order of Court. Following the initial appearance, any party may move
4	the court to order the testimony of any other person or party be taken by deposition
5	on oral examination, if:
6	(1) there is a reasonable probability that the witness will be unable to be
7	present or to testify at the hearing because of the witness' existing physical or
8	mental illness, infirmity, or death;
9	(2) the party taking the deposition cannot procure the attendance of the
10	witness at a hearing by a subpoena, order of the court, or other reasonable means;
11	or
12	(3) on a showing that the information sought cannot be obtained by other
13	means.
14	(c) Subpoena. Attendance of witnesses at oral deposition may be compelled
15	by subpoena as provided by Rule 13. Attendance of parties at oral deposition must
16	be ordered by the court when the court grants a motion under subdivision (b) and
17	must be procured through service of the order and a notice of the time and place of
18	the taking of the deposition on the party.
19	(d) Notice, Oath and Record.

(1) Notice. A party taking a deposition must give reasonable notice in
writing to each party to the action. The notice must state the time and place for
taking the deposition and the name and address of each person to be examined, if
known, and, if the name is not known, a general description sufficient to identify
the person or the particular class or group to which the person belongs.

- (2) Oath and Record. The officer before whom the deposition is to be taken must put the witness on oath and personally, or by someone acting under the officer's direction and in the officer's presence, must record the testimony of the witness. The testimony must be taken stenographically or recorded by audio-visual means or any other means ordered. If requested by one of the parties, the testimony must be transcribed. The court may order the cost of transcription paid by one or some of, or apportioned among, the parties.
- (e) Scope and Manner of Examination; Objections; Motion to Terminate or Limit.
 - (1) Consent Required Participation.

- (A) In no event shall the deposition of a child who is charged with an offense be taken without the child's consent.
- (B) A victim may refuse to participate in a deposition requested by a respondent or a respondent's attorney.
- (2) Scope and Manner of Taking. The scope and manner of examination and cross examination in the taking of a deposition to be used at the hearing must

be the same as that allowed at the hearing.

(3) Objections. All objections made at the time of the examination to the qualifications of the person taking the deposition, or to the manner of taking it, or to the evidence presented or to the conduct of any person present at the depositions and any other objection to the proceedings must be recorded by the officer before whom the deposition is taken. Evidence objected to must be taken subject to the objections unless the objection is based on the witness's use of the Fifth Amendment.

- (4) Motion to Terminate or Limit Examination. At any time during the taking of the deposition, on motion of a party or of the deponent and upon a showing that the examination is being conducted in bad faith or in such manner as unreasonably to annoy, embarrass, or oppress the deponent or party, the court in which the action is pending or the court in the district where the deposition is being taken may order the officer conducting the examination to cease from taking the deposition, or may limit the scope and manner of the taking of the deposition by ordering as follows:
- (A) that certain matters not be inquired into or that the scope of examination be limited to certain matters, or
- (B) that the examination be conducted with no one present except persons designated by the court.
 - (f) Transcription, Certification and Filing. When the testimony is fully

transcribed, the officer must certify on the deposition the witness was duly sworn
and the deposition is a true record of the testimony given by the witness. Unless
otherwise ordered by the court, the officer must securely seal the deposition in an
envelope endorsed with the title of the case and marked "Deposition of (here insert
name of witness)" and must promptly deliver or send the transcript by registered or
certified mail or a traceable third-party commercial delivery service to the party
noticing the deposition, who must be identified on the record. Upon the request of
a party, documents and other things produced during the examination of a witness,
or copies thereof, must be marked for identification and annexed as exhibits to the
deposition, and may be inspected and copied by any party. The exhibits may then
be used in the same manner as if annexed to the deposition.
(g) Failure to Appear. If a party giving notice of the taking of a deposition
fails to attend and proceed therewith and another party attends in person or by
attorney pursuant to the notice, the court may order the party giving the notice to

fails to attend and proceed therewith and another party attends in person or by attorney pursuant to the notice, the court may order the party giving the notice to pay to the other party the reasonable expenses incurred by that party and that party's attorney in attending, including reasonable attorney's fees.

EXPLANATORY NOTE

Rule 12.1 was adopted effective March 1, 2010. <u>Amended</u>

<u>effective</u>_____.

Paragraph (e)(1) was amended, effective , to provide

that a victim may refuse to participate in a deposition requested by a respondent or

83	a respondent's attorney. This right is granted by N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(1)(f).
84	"Victim" is defined in N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(4).
85	SOURCES: Joint Procedure Committee Minutes of <u>January 26-27, 2017</u> ,
86	pages ; Minn. R. Juv. Prot. P. 17.04(b), Minn. R. Juv. Del. P. 10.07,
87	N.D.R.Civ.P. 30.
88	STATUTES AFFECTED:
89	CONSIDERED: N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25.

RULE 3.4. PRIVACY PROTECTION FOR FILINGS MADE WITH THE COURT

1	(a) Redacted Filings.
2	(1) In General. Unless the court orders otherwise, in an electronic or paper
3	filing with the court that contains an individual's social-security number,
4	taxpayer-identification number, or birth date, the name of an individual known to
5	be a minor, a financial-account number, a party or nonparty making the filing must
6	include only:
7	(1) (A) the last four digits of the social-security number and
8	taxpayer-identification number;
9	(2) (B) the year of the individual's birth;
10	(3) (C) the minor's initials; and
11	(4) (D) the last four digits of the financial-account number.
12	(2) Victim Information. If a victim requests, all victim contact information
13	must be redacted from documents to be filed with the court in a criminal or
14	delinquency case.
15	(b) Responsibility of Party or Nonparty to Redact. A party or nonparty
16	making a filing with the court is solely responsible for ensuring that protected
17	information does not appear on the filing.
18	(c) Exemptions from the Redaction Requirement.
19	The redaction requirement does not apply to the following:

20	(1) a financial-account number or real property address that identifies the
21	property allegedly subject to forfeiture in a forfeiture proceeding;
22	(2) the record of an administrative or agency proceeding;
23	(3) the record of a court or tribunal, if that record was not subject to the
24	redaction requirement when originally filed;
25	(4) a filing covered by Rule 3.4 (d);
26	(5) a court filing that is related to a criminal matter and that is prepared
27	before the filing of a criminal charge or is not filed as part of any docketed
28	criminal case;
29	(6) an arrest or search warrant;
30	(7) a charging document and an affidavit filed in support of a charging
31	document;
32	(8) the name of an individual known to be a minor when the minor is a
33	party, and there is no statute, regulation or rule mandating nondisclosure; and
34	(9) a defendant's date of birth in a court filing that is related to criminal
35	matters, non-criminal motor vehicle and game and fish matters, and infractions.
36	(d) Filings Made Under Seal. The court may order that a filing be made
37	under seal without redaction. The court may later unseal the filing or order the
38	person who made the filing to file a redacted version for the public record.
39	(e) Protective Orders. For good cause, the court may by order in a case:
40	(1) require redaction of additional information; or

41	(2) limit or prohibit a nonparty's remote electronic access to a document
42	filed with the court.
43	(f) Filing a Confidential Information Form.
44	(1) In General. A filing that contains redacted information must be filed
45	together with a confidential information form (shown in Appendix H) that
46	identifies each item of redacted information and specifies an appropriate identifier
47	that uniquely corresponds to each item listed. The form will be confidential except
48	as to the parties or as the court may direct. Any reference in the case to a listed
49	identifier will be construed to refer to the corresponding item of information.
50	(2) Defendant Information. In a criminal case, the prosecutor must file a
51	confidential information form that includes, when known, the defendant's social
52	security number.
53	(g) Non-conforming Documents.
54	(1) Waiver. A person waives the protection of Rule 3.4 (a) as to the person's
55	own information by filing it without redaction and not under seal.
56	(2) Sanctions. If a party fails to comply with this rule, the court on motion
57	of another party or its own motion, may order the pleading or other document to be
58	returned to the party for reformation prior to filing, with an extension of any
59	deadline to complete the filing. If the document has been filed, and an order to
60	reform is not obeyed, the court may order the document stricken.
61	EXPLANATORY NOTE

Rule 3.4 was adopted effective March 1, 2009. Rule 3.4 was amende	ed,
effective March 15, 2009; March 1, 2010;	

Parties should limit the amount of protected information they include in court filings. This rule requires parties to redact protected information when its inclusion in a filing cannot be avoided.

This rule's redaction requirements are intended to exclude protected information from public disclosure. Unless a document is also placed in a non-restricted file, redaction of documents filed in cases that are confidential by law or rule is not required.

The term "financial-account number" includes any credit, debit or electronic fund transfer card numbers, and any other financial account number.

Documents containing redacted protected information must be filed together with a confidential information form under subdivision (f) when a party is required by statute, policy or rule to include the protected information in the document. For example, N.D.C.C. § 14-05-02.1 requires a divorce decree to contain the social security numbers of the parties to the divorce. Under subdivision (f), a party to a divorce case may comply with this statute and the redaction requirements of this rule by filing a confidential information form and a redacted version of the decree in the public part of the file.

Subdivision (a) was amended, effective March 1, 2010, to eliminate the requirement to redact addresses in criminal matters.

83	Subdivision (a) was amended, effective , to require, upon
84	request of the victim, the redaction of all victim contact information from
85	documents before they may be filed with the court in a criminal or delinquency
86	case. This right is granted by N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(1)(e). "Victim" is defined in
87	N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(4).
88	Subdivision (b) was adopted, effective March 1, 2010, to indicate it is the
89	responsibility of a party or nonparty making a court filing to refrain from including
90	protected information in the filing.
91	The clerk of court is not required to review a document filed with the court
92	for compliance with this rule.
93	Subdivision (c), formerly subdivision (b), was amended, effective March 1,
94	2010, to add a redaction exemption for the name of a minor when the minor is a
95	party and there is no statute, regulation or rule mandating nondisclosure of the
96	minor's name.
97	Subdivision (c), formerly subdivision (b), was amended, effective March 1,
98	2010, to add a redaction exemption for a defendant's date of birth in a court filing
99	that is related to criminal matters, non-criminal motor vehicle and game and fish
100	matters, and infractions.
101	Subdivision (f) was amended, effective March 1, 2010, to require that
102	state's attorneys file confidential information forms containing certain defendant
103	information when known.

104	Subdivision (g) was amended, effective March 1, 2010, to allow courts to
105	order reformation of documents not in conformity with this rule prior to filing.
106	Sources: Joint Procedure Committee Minutes of <u>January 26-27, 2017</u> ,
107	pages; September 24-25, 2009, pages 3-7; May 21-22, 2009, pages 28-44;
108	January 24, 2008, pages 9-12; October 11-12, 2007, pages 28-30; April 26-27,
109	2007, page 31.
110	Statutes Affected:
111	Considered: N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25; N.D.C.C. § 14-05-02.1
112	Cross Reference: N.D.R.Ct. 3.1 (Pleadings); N.D.Sup.Ct.Admin.R. 41
113	(Access to Judicial Records).

RULE 41. ACCESS TO COURT RECORDS

1	Section 1. Purpose.
2	The purpose of this rule is to provide a comprehensive framework for
3	public access to court records. Every member of the public will have access to
4	court records as provided in this rule.
5	Section 2. Definitions.
6	(a) "Court record," regardless of the form, includes:
7	(1) any document, information, or other thing that is collected, received, or
8	maintained by court personnel in connection with a judicial proceeding;
9	(2) any index, calendar, docket, register of actions, official record of the
10	proceedings, order, decree, judgment, minute, and any information in a case
11	management system created by or prepared by court personnel that is related to a
12	judicial proceeding; and
13	(3) information maintained by court personnel pertaining to the
14	administration of the court or clerk of court office and not associated with any
15	particular case.
16	(b) "Court record" does not include:
17	(1) other records maintained by the public official who also serves as clerk
18	of court;
19	(2) information gathered, maintained or stored by a governmental agency of

20	other entity to which the court has access but which is not part of the court record
21	as defined in this rule; and
22	(3) a record that has been disposed of under court records management
23	rules.
24	(c) "Public access" means that the public may inspect and obtain a copy of
25	the information in a court record.
26	(d) "Remote access" means the ability to electronically search, inspect, or
27	copy information in a court record without the need to physically visit the court
28	facility where the court record is maintained.
29	(e) "Bulk distribution" means the distribution of all, or a significant subset,
30	of the information in court records, as is and without modification or compilation.
31	(f) "Compiled information" means information that is derived from the
32	selection, aggregation or reformulation by the court of some of the information
33	from more than one individual court record.
34	(g) "Electronic form" means information in a court record that exists as:
35	(1) electronic representations of text or graphic documents;
36	(2) an electronic image, including a video image, of a document, exhibit or
37	other thing;
38	(3) data in the fields or files of an electronic database; or
39	(4) an audio or video recording, analog or digital, of an event or notes in an
40	electronic file from which a transcript of an event can be prepared.

41	Section 3. General Access Rule.
42	(a) Public Access to Court Records.
43	(1) Court records are accessible to the public except as prohibited by this
44	rule.
45	(2) There must be a publicly accessible indication of the existence of
46	information in a court record to which access has been prohibited, which
47	indication may not disclose the nature of the information protected.
48	(3) A court may not adopt a more restrictive access policy or otherwise
49	restrict access beyond that provided for in this rule, nor provide greater access than
50	that provided for in this rule.
51	(b) When Court Records May Be Accessed.
52	(1) Court records in a court facility must be available for public access
53	during normal business hours. Court records in electronic form to which the court
54	allows remote access will be available for access subject to technical systems
55	availability.
56	(2) Upon receiving a request for access to a court record, the clerk of court
57	must respond as promptly as practical. If a request cannot be granted promptly, or
58	at all, an explanation must be given to the requestor as soon as possible. The
59	requestor has a right to at least the following information: the nature of any
60	problem preventing access and the specific statute, federal law, or court or
61	administrative rule that is the basis of the denial. The explanation must be in

writing if desired by the requestor.

- (3) The clerk of court is not required to search within a court record for specific information that may be sought by a requestor.
- (c) Access to Court Records Filed Before March 1, 2009. Court records filed before the adoption of N.D.R.Ct. 3.4 may contain protected information listed under N.D.R.Ct. 3.4(a). This rule does not require the review and redaction of protected information from a court record that was filed before the adoption of N.D.R.Ct. 3.4 on March 1, 2009.
- (d) Fees for Access. The court may charge a fee for access to court records in electronic form, for remote access, for bulk distribution or for compiled information. To the extent that public access to information is provided exclusively through a vendor, the court will ensure that any fee imposed by the vendor for the cost of providing access is reasonable.
 - Section 4. Methods of Access to Court Records.
 - (a) Access to Court Records at Court Facility.
- (1) Request for Access. Any person desiring to inspect, examine, or copy a court record must make an oral or written request to the clerk of court. If the request is oral, the clerk may require a written request if the clerk determines that the disclosure of the record is questionable or the request is so involved or lengthy as to need further definition. The request must clearly identify the record requested so that the clerk can locate the record without doing extensive research.

Continuing requests for a document not yet in existence may not be considered.

- (2) Response to Request. The clerk of court is not required to allow access to more than ten files per day per requestor but may do so in the exercise of the clerk's discretion if the access will not disrupt the clerk's primary function. If the request for access and inspection is granted, the clerk may set reasonable time and manner of inspection requirements that ensure timely access while protecting the integrity of the records and preserving the affected office from undue disruption. The inspection area must be within full view of court personnel whenever possible. The person inspecting the records may not leave the court facility until the records are returned and examined for completeness.
- (3) Response by Court. If a clerk of court determines there is a question about whether a record may be disclosed, or if a written request is made under Section 6(b) for a ruling by the court after the clerk denies or grants an access request, the clerk must refer the request to the court for determination. The court must use the standards listed in Section 6 to determine whether to grant or deny the access request.
 - (b) Remote Access to Court Records.
- (1) In General. The following information in court records must be made remotely accessible to the public if it exists in electronic form, unless public access is restricted under this rule:
 - (A) litigant/party indexes to cases filed with the court;

104	(B) listings of new case filings, including the names of the parties;
105	(C) register of actions showing what documents have been filed in a case;
106	(D) calendars or dockets of court proceedings, including the case number
107	and caption, date and time of hearing, and location of hearing; and
108	(E) reports specifically developed for electronic transfer approved by the
109	state court administrator and reports generated in the normal course of business, if
110	the report does not contain information that is excluded from public access under
111	Section 5 or 6.
112	(2) Access Regulation.
113	(A) The Supreme Court may adopt and implement policies to regulate
114	remote access to court records. These policies must be posted publicly on the
115	Court's website.
116	(B) Attorneys licensed in North Dakota may remotely access court records
117	through the secure public access system.
118	(C) A record of a closed criminal case for which there is no conviction may
119	not be remotely accessed through a name search except through the secure public
120	access system.
121	(c) Requests for Bulk Distribution of Court Records.
122	(1) Bulk distribution of information in the court record is permitted for
123	court records that are publicly accessible under Section 3(a).
124	(2) A request for bulk distribution of information not publicly accessible

can be made to the court for scholarly, journalistic, political, governmental, research, evaluation or statistical purposes when the identification of specific individuals is ancillary to the purpose of the inquiry. Prior to the release of information under this subsection the requestor must comply with the provisions of Section 6.

- (3) A court may allow a party to a bulk distribution agreement access to birth date, street address, and social security number information if the party certifies that it will use the data for legitimate purposes as permitted by law.
 - (d) Access to Compiled Information From Court Records.
- (1) Any member of the public may request compiled information that consists solely of information that is publicly accessible and that is not already in an existing report. The court may compile and provide the information if it determines, in its discretion, that providing the information meets criteria established by the court, that the resources are available to compile the information and that it is an appropriate use of public resources. The court may delegate to its staff or the clerk of court the authority to make the initial determination to provide compiled information.
 - (2) Requesting compiled restricted information.
- (A) Compiled information that includes information to which public access has been restricted may be requested by any member of the public only for scholarly, journalistic, political, governmental, research, evaluation, or statistical

146	purposes.
147	(B) The request must:
148	(i) identify what information is sought,
149	(ii) describe the purpose for requesting the information and explain how the
150	information will benefit the public interest or public education, and
151	(iii) explain provisions for the secure protection of any information
152	requested to which public access is restricted or prohibited.
153	(C) The court may grant the request and compile the information if it
154	determines that doing so meets criteria established by the court and is consistent
155	with the purposes of this rule, the resources are available to compile the
156	information, and that it is an appropriate use of public resources.
157	(D) If the request is granted, the court may require the requestor to sign a
158	declaration that:
159	(i) the data will not be sold or otherwise distributed, directly or indirectly, to
160	third parties, except for journalistic purposes,
161	(ii) the information will not be used directly or indirectly to sell a product or
162	service to an individual or the general public, except for journalistic purposes, and
163	(iii) there will be no copying or duplication of information or data provided
164	other than for the stated scholarly, journalistic, political, governmental, research,
165	evaluation, or statistical purpose.
166	The court may make such additional orders as may be needed to protect

167	information to which access has been restricted or prohibited.
168	Section 5. Court Records Excluded From Public Access.
169	The following information in a court record is not accessible to the public:
170	(a) information that is not accessible to the public under federal law;
171	(b) information that is not accessible to the public under state law, court
172	rule, case law or court order, including:
173	(1) affidavits or sworn testimony and records of proceedings in support of
174	the issuance of a search or arrest warrant pending the return of the warrant;
175	(2) information in a complaint and associated arrest or search warrant to the
176	extent confidentiality is ordered by the court under N.D.C.C. §§ 29-05-32 or
177	29-29-22;
178	(3) documents filed with the court for in-camera examination pending
179	disclosure;
180	(4) case information and documents in Child Relinquishment to Identified
181	Adoptive Parent cases brought under N.D.C.C. ch. 14-15.1;
182	(5) domestic violence protection order files and disorderly conduct
183	restraining order files when the restraining order is sought due to domestic
184	violence, except for orders of the court;
185	(6) documents in domestic violence protection order and disorderly conduct
186	restraining order cases in which the initial petition was dismissed summarily by the
187	court without a contested hearing;

188	(7) names of qualified or summoned jurors and contents of jury
189	qualification forms if disclosure is prohibited or restricted by order of the court;
190	(8) records of voir dire of jurors, unless disclosure is permitted by court
191	order or rule;
192	(9) records of deferred impositions of sentences resulting in dismissal;
193	(10) records of a case in which the magistrate finds no probable cause for
194	the issuance of a complaint;
195	(11) unless exempted from redaction by N.D.R.Ct. 3.4(c), protected
196	information:
197	(A) except for the last four digits, social security numbers, taxpayer
198	identification numbers, and financial account numbers,
199	(B) except for the year, birth dates, and
200	(C) except for the initials, the name of an individual known to be a minor,
201	unless the minor is a party, and there is no statute, regulation, or rule mandating
202	nondisclosure;
203	(12) judge and court personnel work material, including personal calendars,
204	communications from law clerks, bench memoranda, notes, work in progress, draft
205	documents and non-finalized documents;
206	(13) party, witness and crime victim contact information gathered and
207	recorded by the court for administrative purposes, including telephone numbers
208	and e-mail, street and postal addresses;

209	(14) the name of a patron of the North Dakota Legal Self Help Center or
210	information sufficient to identify a patron or the subject about which a patron
211	requested information.
212	(c) This rule does not preclude access to court records by the following
213	persons in the following situations:
214	(1) federal, state, and local officials, or their agents, examining a court
215	record in the exercise of their official duties and powers;
216	(2) parties to an action and their attorneys examining the court file of the
217	action, unless restricted by order of the court, but parties and attorneys may not
218	access judge and court personnel work material in the court file.
219	(d) A member of the public may request the court to allow access to
220	information excluded under Section 5 as provided in Section 6.
221	Section 6. Requests to Prohibit Public Access to Information in Court
222	Records or to Obtain Access to Restricted Information.
223	(a) Request to Prohibit Access.
224	(1) A request to the court to prohibit public access to information in a court
225	record may be made by any party to a case, by the individual about whom
226	information is present in the court record, or on the court's own motion on notice
227	as provided in Section 6(c).
228	(2) The court must decide whether there are sufficient grounds to overcome
229	the presumption of openness of court records and prohibit access according to

applicable constitutional, statutory and case law.

- (3) In deciding whether to prohibit access the court must consider that the presumption of openness may only be overcome by an overriding interest. The court must articulate this interest along with specific findings sufficient to allow a reviewing court to determine whether the closure order was properly entered.
- (4) The closure of the records must be no broader than necessary to protect the articulated interest. The court must consider reasonable alternatives to closure, such as redaction or partial closure, and the court must make findings adequate to support the closure. The court may not deny access only on the ground that the record contains confidential or closed information.
- (5) In restricting access the court must use the least restrictive means that will achieve the purposes of this rule and the needs of the requestor.
- (6) If a victim requests, all victim contact information in a criminal court record must be redacted;
- (6) (7) If the court concludes, after conducting the balancing analysis and making findings as required by paragraphs (1) through (5), that the interest of justice will be served, it may prohibit public Internet access to an individual defendant's electronic court record in a criminal case:
 - (A) if the charges against the defendant are dismissed; or
 - (B) if the defendant is acquitted.
- If the court grants a request to prohibit public Internet access to an

electronic court record in a criminal case, the search result for the record must 251 display the words "Internet Access Prohibited under N.D.Sup.Ct. Admin.R 41." 252 253 (b) Request to Obtain Access. (1) A request to obtain access to information in a court record to which 254 255 access is prohibited under Section 4(a), 5 or 6(a) may be made to the court by any 256 member of the public or on the court's own motion on notice as provided in Section 6(c). 257 258 (2) In deciding whether to allow access, the court must consider whether 259 there are sufficient grounds to overcome the presumption of openness of court 260 records and continue to prohibit access under applicable constitutional, statutory 261 and case law. In deciding this the court must consider the standards outlined in 262 Section 6(a). 263 (c) Form of Request. 264 (1) The request must be made by a written motion to the court. 265 (2) The requestor must give notice to all parties in the case. 266 (3) The court may require notice to be given by the requestor or another party to any individuals or entities identified in the information that is the subject 267 268 of the request. When the request is for access to information to which access was 269 previously prohibited under Section 6(a), the court must provide notice to the 270 individual or entity that requested that access be prohibited. 271 Section 7. Obligations Of Vendors Providing Information Technology

Support To A Court To Maintain Court Records.

- (a) If the court contracts with a vendor to provide information technology support to gather, store, or make accessible court records, the contract will require the vendor to comply with the intent and provisions of this rule. For purposes of this section, "vendor" includes a state, county or local governmental agency that provides information technology services to a court.
- (b) By contract the vendor will be required to notify the court of any requests for compiled information or bulk distribution of information, including the vendor's requests for such information for its own use.

EXPLANATORY NOTE

Adopted on an emergency basis effective October 1, 1996; Amended and adopted effective November 12, 1997; March 1, 2001; July 1, 2006; March 1, 2009; March 15, 2009; March 1, 2010; March 1, 2012; March 1, 2015; March 1, 2016; March 1, 2017; ________. Appendix amended effective August 1, 2001, to reflect the name change of State Bar Board to State Board of Law Examiners.

Section 3(b)(3) was added, effective March 1, 2016, to clarify that the clerk of court is not required to search within a court record for specific information that may be sought by a requestor.

Section 3(c) was adopted, effective March 1, 2010, to state that protected information may be contained in court records filed before the adoption of

N.D.R.Ct. 3.4.

Section 4(b) was amended, effective March 1, 2017, to allow the Supreme Court to enact and implement policies to regulate remote access to court records, to allow attorneys to remotely access court records through the secure public access system, and to limit remote access by name search to pre-conviction records in criminal cases.

Section 4(c) was amended, effective March 15, 2009, to allow parties who enter into bulk distribution agreements with the courts to have access to birth date, street address, and social security number information upon certifying compliance with laws governing the security of protected information. Such laws include the Federal Fair Credit Reporting Act, the Gramm Leach Bliley Act, the USA Patriot Act and the Driver's Privacy Protection Act.

Section 5(b)(6) was amended, effective March 1, 2015, to clarify that the restriction on public access to documents in domestic violence protection order and disorderly conduct restraining order cases under this paragraph is limited to cases that were dismissed summarily.

Section 5(b)(8) was amended, effective March 15, 2009, to list types of protected information open to the public. The term "financial-account number" in Section 5(b)(8) includes any credit, debit or electronic fund transfer card number, and any other financial account number.

Section 5(b)(8) was amended, effective March 1, 2010, to incorporate the

314	exemptions from redaction contained in N.D.R.Ct. 3.4(b). A document containing
315	protected information that is exempt from redaction under N.D.R.Ct. 3.4(b) is
316	accessible to the public.
317	Section 5(b)(10) was added, effective March 1, 2017, to exclude cases in
318	which a magistrate finds no probable cause for the issuance of a complaint from
319	public access.
320	Section 5(b)(12) was added, effective March 1, 2016, to exclude party,
321	witness and crime victim contact information gathered and recorded by the court
322	for administrative purposes from public access.
323	Section 5(b)(13) was added, effective March 1, 2017, to exclude
324	information about patrons of the North Dakota Legal Self Help Center from public
325	access.
326	Section 6(a)(6) was added, effective , to require, upon
327	request of the victim, redaction of all victim contact information in a criminal court
328	record. This right is granted by N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(1)(e). "Victim" is defined
329	in N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25(4).
330	Section 6(a)(6) (7) was added, effective March 1, 2012, to provide a method
331	for the court to prohibit public Internet access to an electronic case record when
332	charges against a defendant are dismissed or the defendant is acquitted. A request
333	under Section 6(a)(1) is required before the court can act to prohibit access under
334	Section 6(a)(6).

335	Nothing in this rule or N.D.R.Ct. 3.4 precludes a clerk of court or the
336	electronic case management system from identifying non-confidential records that
337	match a name and date of birth or a name and social security number.
338	Joint Procedure Committee Minutes of <u>January 26-27, 2017</u> , pages;
339	September 29-30, 2016, pages 6-9, 28-29; May 12-13, 2016, pages 22-25; January
340	28-29, 2016, pages 2-7; September 24-25, 2015, pages 15-16, 20-21; April 23-24,
341	2015, pages 8-10; April 24-25, 2014, page 27; April 28-29, 2011, pages 9-12;
342	September 23-24, 2010, pages 16-20; September 24-25, 2009, pages 8-9; May
343	21-22, 2009, pages 28-44; January 29-20, 2009, pages 3-4; September 25, 2008,
344	pages 2-6; January 24, 2008, pages 9-12; October 11-12, 2007, pages 28-30; April
345	26-27, 2007, page 31; September 22-23, 2005, pages 6-16; April 28-29, 2005,
346	pages 22-25; April 29-30, 2004, pages 6-13, January 29-30, 2004, pages 3-8;
347	September 16-17, 2003, pages 2-11; April 24-25, 2003, pages 6-12. Court
348	Technology Committee Minutes of June 18, 2004; March 19, 2004; September 12,
349	2003; Conference of Chief Justices/Conference of State Court Administrators:
350	Guidelines for Public Access to Court Records.
351	Statutes Affected:
352	Considered: N.D. Const. Art. I, § 25.
353	Cross Reference: N.D.R.Ct. 3.4 (Privacy Protection for Filings Made With
354	the Court).